

לוקוטי ופסקי הלכות "חוקי חיים"

ותלמוד
"תקצי תתקצי"
לעשות רצונך
בלבב שלם

חוקי חיים

שע"י "חדר הוראה" שכונת מנחת יצחק פעיה"ק ירושלם תובב"א - בראשות הרב חיים אהרן בלייער שליט"א

Halachos compiled by HaRav Chaim Bleier – Translated from the Hebrew edition by R' Zerachya Shicker

Please do not
read during
davening or
Krias HaTorah

Halachos of Sukkos

Sukkos 5786

363

Eating in the Sukkah, Brachah on the Sukkah

Eating a Meal vs. a Snack [Keva vs. Arai]

- Living in the sukkah.** The mitzvah of sukkah is that one should eat, drink, and live in the sukkah all seven days, both by day and by night, the same way one lives in his house during the rest of the year. All seven days, one should make his house secondary and his sukkah his main residence (ש"י תרל"ט ס"א) (ש"י ס"ב).
- Only meals must be eaten in the sukkah; strictly speaking, snacks may be eaten outside the sukkah (ש"י ס"ב). Snacks are not significant enough to require eating in the sukkah since even when one lives in his house, it is common to eat snacks outside the house (מ"ב סק"ב). We will list several things that are considered snacks.
- Personally being machmir.** If one is personally machmir not to even drink water outside the sukkah, that is praiseworthy (ש"י ס"ב). The same goes for less than the required amount of bread (מ"ב סק"ד) as well as other foods that, strictly speaking, may be eaten outside the sukkah, as will be explained (א"ר). Some say that the reason for this chumra is to make sure one will not end up eating a meal outside the sukkah (ש"י ס"ב). (ש"י שואל ומשיב רביעא ח"ג סי' י"א) Most poskim hold that the reason is that doing this fulfills the mitzvah of sukkah in the best way, just Chazal did not make this mandatory (קונטרס הלוי). הגר"ז והגר"ח הביאורים סוכה סי' י"ז, שנות אליהו הובא בביאור"ל סי' רל"ב ס"ב ד"ה ואם

Bread

- Up to a kebeitzah of bread is considered a snack and may, strictly speaking, be eaten outside the sukkah. This is about 40-50 grams in modern-day terms. More than this should not be eaten outside the sukkah. To say the brachah of Leisheiv Basukkah when eating bread, one must eat more than two modern-day kebeitzim – about 90-100 grams (שיעורין של תורה שיעורי המצוות אות כ"א וכו').
- Longer than kedai achilas pras.** The poskim argue whether one may eat more than a kebeitzah of bread outside the sukkah if he takes longer than kedai achilas pras to eat it. Some say that as long as one makes sure to take longer than kedai achilas pras, e.g., a kebeitzah spread over ten minutes, it is considered a snack that may be eaten outside the sukkah (בכורי יעקב סק"ג, שיעורי תורה סי' ג' סק"ט).
- Others say that taking longer than kedai achilas pras does not allow it to be eaten outside the sukkah since one does not eat such a quantity of bread outside his house even if he will take longer than kedai achilas pras to eat it (מקראי קודש סוכה ח"א סי' ל"א). These poskim also hold that when one eats an amount of food that requires the brachah of Leisheiv, he may say the brachah even if it takes him longer than kedai achilas pras (חוט שני סוכה). On the first night of Sukkos though, one must eat the first kezayis within kedai achilas pras (מ"ב תרל"ט סק"ב) – two minutes lechumra (שיעורין של תורה).

Mezonos

- Cooked mezonos.** Cooked foods made from the five grains, e.g., pasta, couscous, lokshen kugel, and the like, must be eaten in the sukkah when eaten as a meal (ש"י ס"ב), i.e., when eaten with a group of people or in a quantity significant enough to be considered a meal (מ"ב סק"ו) – three or four kebeitzim (ש"י ס"ב). Some are machmir and consider these foods like bread; accordingly, more than a kebeitzah must be eaten in the sukkah (מ"א). Therefore, one should be machmir not to eat more than a kebeitzah outside the sukkah, but Leisheiv should only be said when the cooked mezonos is eaten as a meal, as stated above (מ"ב ס"ב).

Pas Haba Bekisnin

- Snack.** Strictly speaking, pas haba bekisnin eaten as a snack, e.g., less than a kebeitzah of cake or cookies, does not need to be eaten in the sukkah, while more than a kebeitzah does. But since this is a machlokes between the poskim, even after eating more than a kebeitzah, one should stay in the sukkah for some time afterward to be able to say Leisheiv, having in mind both the eating and the time spent which was done as "an act of dwelling" (מ"ב סק"ו). Even in this scenario, one should first say Mezonos and then Leisheiv (חוט שני סוכה עמ' ר"ג).

- Kiddush, breakfast.** When eating pas haba bekisnin as a substitute for breakfast or at Kiddush on Shabbos or Yom Tov, more than a kebeitzah should not be eaten outside the sukkah whatsoever. Also, one may say Leisheiv even if he will not stay in the sukkah after eating since his circumstances render the food a meal (מ"ב ס"ב).

Fruits

- Strictly speaking, fruits may be eaten outside the sukkah even if they are eaten as a meal (רמ"א ס"ב) since eating even a large quantity of fruits as a meal is like eating a bit of bread as a snack (מ"ב ס"ב). Therefore, even if one eats a lot and stays in the sukkah afterward, he should not say Leisheiv.
- Shivas haminim.** Strictly speaking, even fruits from the shivas haminim, e.g., pomegranates or grapes, do not need to be eaten in the sukkah. Thus, even when they are eaten as a meal, one should not say Leisheiv. Even dates, which are nourishing (גמ' ברכות דף י"ב), do not effect a chiyuv sukkah.

Meat, Cheese, Eggs, Vegetables

- Some say that strictly speaking, meat, cheese, eggs, rice, vegetables, and the like may be eaten outside the sukkah since even in large quantities, they are not a meal in the same way that bread is (ש"י ס"ב). Others say that when eaten as a meal, they must be eaten in the sukkah (מ"ב סק"ו), especially nowadays when most people eat entire main meals without bread (ש"י ס"א). Still, since they aren't bread, one should not say Leisheiv.

Wine

- Arai.** Drinking wine is also considered arai. Thus, strictly speaking one may drink wine outside the sukkah (ש"י ס"ב), even in a keva type of way (רמ"א וכו' ס"ב).
- Keva.** Some poskim hold that if one drinks wine in a keva manner, i.e., with a group of people or in a large quantity, he must drink in the sukkah. However, many poskim hold that one should not say Leisheiv (מ"ב סק"ו); some poskim hold that one should say Leisheiv. Therefore, it is best to drink the wine along with some mezonos or during a meal (מ"ב ס"ב). The same is true for other prominent beverages that are drunk in a keva manner.
- Havdalah.** One should say Havdalah on a cup of wine in the sukkah since all year it is done in the house, and one must live in the sukkah the way he lives in his house (מ"ב ס"ב). Since Leisheiv is not usually said on wine alone, some poskim hold that it shouldn't be said at Havdalah. Others hold that Leisheiv is said at Havdalah on a cup of wine (ל"א) since people do not say Havdalah outside and, accordingly, Havdalah is inherently keva (ש"י ס"ב). Still, the minhag is to eat some mezonos right after Havdalah and stay in the sukkah for a bit in order to satisfy all opinions (הגרש"א).
- Bris in a beis medrash.** When a bris is held in a beis medrash, one may say the brachah and drink the cup of wine outside the sukkah since strictly speaking, wine does not need to be drunk in the sukkah (above, 13). Still, it is best to drink less than a revi'is so it is not considered keva. It is not necessary to drink a revi'is of wine at a bris since it is not a halachah from the Gemara (ש"י ס"ב ס"א).

Water, Other Drinks

- Strictly speaking, one may drink water or other drinks outside the sukkah, even in large quantities (ש"י ס"ב). Nevertheless, if one is machmir to drink even water in the sukkah – and certainly everything else we discussed – that is praiseworthy (as mentioned above, 3).

The Brachah of Leisheiv Basukkah

Enactment of the Brachah

- Entering the sukkah.** Some Rishonim say that one should say Leisheiv every time he enters the sukkah, whether he goes there to eat, sit, or sleep (הר"ף כ"ב ע"א, רמב"ם פ"ו ה"ב).
- Eating.** Others say that one should only say Leisheiv before eating – the main form of dwelling in the sukkah – and that covers sleeping and all other times he enters, which are secondary to eating (ר"ת הובא בתוס'). This is the prevalent minhag (מ"א תרל"ט סק"ו) (ברכות י"א ד"ה שכבר) to say the brachah only when eating a meal, as explained above.

20. **Eating before sitting in the sukkah.** Some say that it is advisable to satisfy all opinions. In other words, when one plans to stay in the sukkah for some time, he should eat more than a kebeitzah of mezonos and say Leishev right when he enters the sukkah, even if he is going to eat a meal later, and then he should not say Leishev again before his meal (מ"ב סי תרל"ט סקמ"ו). However, it should be pointed out that this is a good practice, but one should not refrain from sitting in the sukkah if he doesn't have or is not in the mood to eat mezonos food.

21. **Eating before sleeping.** Similarly, it is good to eat something that requires a Leishev before going to sleep so that the mitzvah of sleeping in the sukkah, which extends over a long time, is preceded by a brachah (תוס' ר' יהודה החסיד ברכות שם, רא"ש סוכה פ"ד סי ג').

Visiting a Friend's Sukkah During a Meal

22. **Planned.** If one had in mind when he said Leishev that he would be leaving his sukkah during the meal and continuing in his friend's sukkah, he should not say a new brachah before continuing the meal at his friend's sukkah (מ"ב שם סקמ"ח). If someone regularly goes to his rebbe's tish, it is considered as if he had that in mind, and he should not say the brachah there.

23. **Unplanned.** If he was not originally planning to go, the poskim argue whether he should say Leishev again (ובשעה"צ). Due to the rule of "safeik brachos lehakeil," he should not say it again.

Sitting in a Sukkah, Rain

24. Rain is undesirable during Sukkos, as we all want to fulfill the mitzvah of sukkah. Thus, we begin davening for rain only after Sukkos, on Shemini Atzeres (מ"ב סי קל"ד סק"א). Nevertheless, sometimes it rains on Sukkos – in Eretz Yisroel, on occasion, and in certain places in Chutz L'aretz, often. It is therefore worthwhile to write about the halachos that apply when it rains on Sukkos, the differences between eating (26) and sleeping (40).

Reason for the Petur of Rain

25. **תשובו כעין תדורו.** The simple reason one is patur from the mitzvah of sukkah when it rains is because it would be uncomfortable [מצטער] to sit in the sukkah, which is inconsistent with "תשובו כעין תדורו" [dwelling in the sukkah the same way one lives in his house] – no one would live in a house in which it rains. Thus, a sukkah in which it rains is also not called a house fit for dwelling.

Amount of Rain Which Makes One Patur from Eating

26. **Ruins the food.** The Gemara says the amount of rain that makes one patur from eating in the sukkah is when it is enough to spoil a certain thick food [משתרר המקור], i.e., the food will be ruined, even if it is something easily ruined with a little water, e.g., beans (ש"י סי תרל"ט ס"ה). Even if one does not have this food before him – or even if there is no food in front of him at all – he is patur from the mitzvah of sukkah as long as it is raining that amount in the place he is sitting (ב"י, רמ"א שם).

27. **If it rained that much in his house.** Today, for the most part, we are not familiar with how much rain spoils this thick food. Thus, we assess whether one would relocate to another, less comfortable room [e.g., a storage room] if it were raining this amount in his regular house (רמ"א סי"ה, א"א מבטשאטש סי"ד, שו"ת מהרש"ג ח"א סי' ל"ג). הגרש"א הליכות שלמה פ"ט סי"ה, הגריש"א שבות יצחק סוכה זמן שמחתנו פ"ג (אות ב'). It does not need to be raining so much that one would leave his house to go to a friend's house (מהרש"ג שם).

28. **The specific spot he is sitting in.** Even if it is raining in one's sukkah enough to make him patur, he is not patur if it is not raining in his specific spot by the table. He can even make the brachah of לישב as long as he is not patur in his specific spot. However, if he is very sensitive [איסטינס], he should not make the brachah (מ"ב סקל"ג).

29. **Thick s'chach.** If it is raining enough outside to make an average sukkah patur, but there is someone with thick s'chach and it is not raining that much in his sukkah, he is not patur and may even make a brachah on eating there (שו"ת שבט הלוי ח"ג סי' ע'). He is only patur if it is raining in his sukkah enough to make him patur (ברכת הבית שער לב סי' ד).

30. **Sees that rain is coming.** Even if one sees rain is coming or the forecast says it will rain, he is not patur from his chiyuv to eat in the sukkah until it actually rains into his sukkah (שו"ת שבט הלוי ח"ג סי' קצ"א סק"ב).

First Night

31. Most Rishonim hold the petur מצטער applies on the first night, and one is patur even from eating one k'zayis of bread (רשב"א, מאמר מרדכי (ראב"ד, ביאור הגר"א, א"א סי' תרל"ט ס"ה).

32. However, there are Rishonim who hold, based on a gezeirah shavah [ט"ו ט"ז] from matzah, that one must eat a k'zayis of bread in the sukkah on the first night of Sukkos no matter what (ר"ן, רא"ש ברכות (פ"ו ס"ג, טור (שם). This is the Rama's opinion (שם).

33. **Brachah.** Since it is unclear whether one is chayav in sukkah if it rains on the first night, some Acharonim suggest that while one should be machmir to eat a k'zayis as per the Rama, he should not make a brachah due to the rule of להקל להקל (פסק הובא במ"ב סקל"ה).

34. **How long to wait.** Some write that if it is raining hard on the first night of Sukkos and one would not be able to make a brachah if he would eat a k'zayis right away (above, 33), it is proper to wait until the night chatzot for the rain to stop in order to make Kiddush and say Shehecheyanu, which also goes on eating in the sukkah according to all opinions (הובא במ"ב סקל"ה). However, most poskim hold one should only wait an hour or two, depending on the circumstances. Otherwise, the simchas Yom Tov of him, his family, and his guests –

poor guests in particular – will be impaired. Thus, one should say Kiddush and eat a k'zayis in the sukkah without a brachah (above, 33).

35. **Second night in Chutz L'aretz.** Some say one does not need to eat in the sukkah if it is raining on the second night of Yom Tov in Chutz L'aretz; he can rely on the opinions that there is no chiyuv to eat a k'zayis in the sukkah in the rain (מ"א סקט"ו, הגר"ז). However, others argue one should be machmir to eat a k'zayis in the sukkah on the second night too (שער הציון). Thus, it is proper to be machmir and eat a k'zayis in the sukkah without saying the brachah (לישב בסוכה). However, one does not need to wait and delay his seudah at all for this; he can eat a k'zayis in the sukkah even at the end of the seudah. If the rain stops then, he can make a brachah.

Returning to the Sukkah When the Rain Stops

36. **Left the sukkah, entered the house.** If one began eating in the sukkah but went to his house because of rain and continued eating, he does not need to return to the sukkah if the rain then stops until he finishes his seudah (שו"ת שם סי' ו'). However, he can be machmir on himself and return to the sukkah if he wants; he is not called a fool for that (מ"ב סי' תר"מ סק"ב ושער הציון). He can even make a brachah if he hasn't done so yet or diverted his focus [היסח הדעת].

37. However, if one merely entered his house but did not sit down to eat, he must return to the sukkah (מ"ב סקל"ה). If, when he left the sukkah, it seemed he would be unable to return due to the amount of rain, he must also say the brachah of לישב בסוכה again.

38. **Remained in the sukkah and closed the shlock.** If one has a retractable roof that can be closed if it rains ["a shlock"] – very common in Chutz L'aretz – and he remained in his sukkah while it rained, that is not considered like he left his sukkah. Therefore, even if he got settled and continued eating with the shlock closed, he must open the shlock right when the rain stops and continue eating under the s'chach. He must do this even if he has to go out of the sukkah to open the shlock and it is a hassle for him (מ"ב סי' תרל"ט סקמ"א ושער הציון סקע"ח).

39. **New brachah with shlock open?** Some hold that if one closed the shlock because of rain, it is like he left the sukkah and entered his house, as while it was raining, the sukkah was not fit for the mitzvah. Thus, in a case where one would need to make a new brachah upon returning to the sukkah, one must also make a new brachah upon opening the shlock (שו"ת לבושי מרדכי ח"ג סי' נ"ב). However, most poskim hold that if one stayed in the sukkah and just closed the shlock while it rained, it is not an interruption, so he does not make a new brachah upon opening the shlock (ברכת הבית שער לב סי' ו'עוד).

Amount of Rain Which Makes One Patur from Sleeping

40. The standard for rain for sleeping is slightly different than the standard for eating. If one is sleeping in the sukkah and it begins to rain, he does not need to assess whether food will be ruined, as he does when eating (above, 26). He can leave even if it is just raining a bit, as that makes it uncomfortable to sleep there (רמ"א שם סי' ו').

41. **Sees rain is coming.** We mentioned (30) that even if one can tell rain is coming, he is not patur from eating in the sukkah until it is actually raining. However, some say that with respect to sleeping, one does not need to go into the sukkah in the first place if he sees rain is coming, as people would not go to sleep in a spot where it will rain (הגר"נ קרליץ, חוט שני סוכות עמ' רמ"ז).

42. **First night.** Some hold that, just like with the chiyuv of eating, there is a chiyuv to sleep in the sukkah on the first night of Sukkos even if it is raining (ע"י שו"ת שבט הלוי ח"ג סי' ע'). However, the consensus of all the poskim is that this is just true for eating, not for sleeping; this is the minhag (ע"י שו"ת שבט הלוי ח"ג סי' ע').

Returning to Sleep in the Sukkah When the Rain Stops

43. **Did not lie down yet.** If one entered his house due to the rain and then the rain stopped before he lay down, he must return to the sukkah (מ"א סקט"ז).

44. **Already lay down.** If he already lay in his bed, he does not need to return to the sukkah (שו"ת שם סי' ו').

45. **Woke up during the night.** If one woke up during the night, he does not need to return (שם). However, the poskim write it is proper to return to the sukkah if he can do so easily, e.g., the sukkah is on a balcony off his room or he is sleeping in the sukkah with the shlock closed and he can open it from the inside – and certainly if he can open the shlock just by pressing a button.

46. **Woke up after the time to get up.** If someone went to sleep in his house and then the rain stopped, one does not need to wake him up for him to return to the sukkah that entire night. He can continue sleeping in the house until he naturally wakes up after dawn (שו"ת, רמ"א סי' ו'מ"ב שם) [עמוד השחר] – or nowadays, after the time when most people get up [not when he personally gets up after going to sleep late because of a simchas beis hasho'evah...]. The poskim only wrote dawn because back then, it was normal to get up shortly after dawn (שו"ת תרל"ט אות סי' ו').

47. **Sleep during the day.** Similarly, if someone went to sleep during the day in his house due to the rain, one does not need to wake him up once the rain stops. If he wakes up on his own and wants to go back to sleep, he must go into the sukkah (ביכורי יעקב סקל"ז).